



Punk and feminism in Indonesia

Jim Donaghey

To cite this article: Jim Donaghey (2020): Punk and feminism in Indonesia, Cultural Studies

To link to this article: <https://doi.org/10.1080/09502386.2020.1844262>



Published online: 24 Nov 2020.



Submit your article to this journal [↗](#)



View related articles [↗](#)



View Crossmark data [↗](#)



Punk and feminism in Indonesia

Jim Donaghey  *

School of History, Anthropology, Philosophy and Politics, Queen's University Belfast, Belfast, UK

ABSTRACT

A strong feminist strand has run through punk since its earliest incarnations, but, because punk scenes are inevitably affected by their wider social contexts, the influences of sexism and patriarchy must be continually (re)negotiated – feminist punk interventions are therefore a key aspect of contemporary 'global punk'. This deliberate and conscious feminist interventionism is a key aspect of punk in Indonesia too, recursively taking its cues from 'punk history itself'. Feminist punk interventions in Indonesia include feminist zines, women-centric bands, explicitly feminist gigs and festivals, communication and support networks of punk women, and anarcho-feminist 'info-house' initiatives. These interventions are necessary because, as elsewhere in the world, sexism is part of the lived experience for punk women in Indonesia. Patriarchal repression is acute in wider Indonesian society, and, despite the rhetoric of equality and opposition to oppression, these sexist norms are reproduced in the punk scene in the form of homosocial gender division, marginalization of women, derision of feminist initiatives, sexual objectification, and sexual assault. The influence of morally conservative fundamentalist Islam in Indonesia also shapes expressions of sexism in the punk scene.

Drawing on three periods of ethnographic research (2012, 2015, 2018), as well as key secondary sources such as the *Ini Scene Kami Juga! (This Is Our Scene Too!)* documentary film (2016), and ongoing dialogue with women in Indonesia's punk scenes, this article considers the influence of feminist interventions in punk. Whilst feminist objectives are limited to transforming their immediate punk scene, and though they face continued sexism within the scene and concerted repression from the state and from religious groups, these initiatives represent a significant political/cultural platform for feminism in wider Indonesian society.

KEYWORDS Punk; Indonesia; feminism; sexism; intervention; anarchism

Introduction

CONTENT NOTE – Participants recount experiences and effects of physical sexual assault including detail of assaults themselves in the section entitled accordingly. All interviewee names are pseudonyms, and all interviewees self-identify as women unless otherwise stated.

CONTACT Jim Donaghey  j.donaghey@qub.ac.uk

*Present address: School of Communication and Media, Ulster University, Coleraine, Northern Ireland.

© 2020 Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group

Punk in Indonesia has been a focus for numerous researchers since the 1990s, but women have never been the main feature of those analyses. The experience of punk women in Indonesia highlights sexism within that scene, contributing to ongoing discussions around sexism in punk, but also speaks to the everyday experience of patriarchy in Indonesia, repression of punk in Indonesia, and the influence of feminist interventions within the punk scene and in wider society. This article overviews the relationship between punk and feminism, then discusses various manifestations of sexism in the punk scene in Indonesia, as well as the relationship between religion and sexism, before considering feminist interventions in the punk scene, their aims, and potential influence.

As I will discuss in detail, whilst recognizing that women face oppression in Indonesia, and highlighting that the feminist movement is actively repressed, it is relevant to acknowledge that the motivations for this repression are frequently rooted in morally conservative religion. It is even more important to avoid the trap identified by Adriany et al. (2017, pp. 289–290, emphasis added) of treating ‘women in the Global South ... as a singular and monolithic group’, nor to assert that ‘Muslim women are *all* oppressed’, nor that ‘non-Western women ... are always ... subordinate and ... [have] no agency at all’. As Spivak (2000) asserts, they do not need to be saved by feminists from the ‘Global North’. As a white cis-gendered man (albeit from a peripheral and colonized ‘Western’ context), and especially as a white man working within the ‘ivory tower’ of academia, positionality and ethical considerations come immediately to the fore. I situate myself as an ‘insider’ within the ‘global punk’ scene, but I am clearly ‘outside’ the perspective of women in Indonesia, whether punk or not, so asking people to relive emotional trauma to produce an academic article risks exploitation. The anarchist tradition of bottom-up, non-exploitative ethnographies is a starting point in efforts to decolonize research practices (Shome 2009), and methodologically this comes down to a dialogical approach, which ‘moves beyond simply “giving voice” to those being researched, to also involve those voices in the analysis and critique’ (Donaghey 2017, p. 310). This has hopefully been achieved through a strong emphasis on testimony from women punks in Indonesia, and by sharing drafts of this article with the respondents for comment, and explicitly including the option for retraction and veto.

Much scholarship regurgitates the narrative of punk as a neatly defined cultural moment confined to the USA and UK in the mid-to-late 1970s – but even by the end of the 1970s punk had spread far beyond its Anglo-American birthing ponds, and this historical place-specific focus completely misses punk’s contemporary global manifestations. This is not to say that punk’s own global cultural flows are free from the effects of Anglo-American hegemony nor neo-colonial inequalities. Whilst the term ‘global punk’ speaks to the shared tropes, aesthetics, values and networks of an interconnected and

mutually comprehensible international punk scene, it is not a homogenous descriptor – as Mackintosh *et al.* (2010, p. 15) put it, ‘there are always points and moments where “trans-local” communication fails’. This article will analyse ‘punk Indonesia’ in its own terms rather than hold it up for comparison with supposedly ‘authentic’ originator scenes in the USA or UK. However, this is not entirely a locally recursive definition, since the Indonesian punk scene does *make sense of itself* as part of a ‘global punk’ community. The shared ‘punk values’ of equality and resistance to oppression are pertinent examples of this global network. As Driscoll and Morris (2013, p. 169) highlight, this also applies to culturally expressed conceptions of gender, that in their ‘particularizing and universalizing tendencies, cut[] across transnational cultural flows and geopolitical boundary conventions alike’.

This ‘trans-localism’ is one core feature that ties together this special issue – as it is framed in the introduction, ‘the concept of underground not only travels but is in fact recursively redefined’ (Valjakka), and this goes for punk and feminism as well. Punk can clearly be understood as an ‘underground’ movement, with ‘undergroundness’ held as a punk virtue: manifested in non- or anti-capitalist DIY production, distribution and networking (see, e.g. Holtzman *et al.* 2007), and in its self-consciously counter-cultural ethos informed by, and overlapping with, the anarchist movement. There have been rushes of corporate co-optation of punk, notably in the late 1970s (focused in the UK) and 1990s/early 2000s (largely in the USA), but whilst Indonesia arguably boasts the world’s largest punk scene, it is in some senses an especially ‘underground’ example in terms of DIY production, having had only a handful of bands sign to corporate labels,¹ though the neo-colonial marginalization of the Indonesian punk scene is a factor here, and sponsorship of punk gigs by cigarette corporations is an ongoing problem (see Donaghey 2016). Indonesia is also the contemporary global context where punk is most actively repressed by state and para-state institutions – this repression is in terms of punk’s outward contravention of Islamic doctrine and its perception as a Western import. So punk is *driven* underground in addition to its adoption of ‘undergroundness’ as a counter-cultural virtue.

The feminist movement in Indonesia is also repressed by some groups, especially those associated with Islamic radicalism, which ‘perceives feminism as part of the Western hegemonic project’ and as ‘incompatible with Islamic teachings’ (Budiman 2008, pp. 73, 81). This is the same grounding that motivates repression of punk, but, unlike punk, the mainstream feminist movement does not view ‘undergroundness’ as a virtue, and rather makes efforts to engage with the overlapping hegemonic forces of state and religion. Those who might be identified as ‘secular feminists’ (Karam 1998) point to Indonesia’s adoption of the United Nation’s 1979 ‘Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women’ (signed by Indonesia in 1980 and

ratified on 13 September 1984) as a legal basis to challenge gender inequality, campaigning at the level of government policy on issues such as

domestic violence ... trafficking, women's reproductive rights ... Female Genital Mutilation ... polygamy, unregistered or secret forms of marriage ... child marriage ... and women's public and private leadership roles. (van Doorn-Hader 2016, p. 2)

'Secular feminists' argue specifically for changes to the Marriage Act 1974 and the Counter-Legal Draft of the Compilation of Islamic Law 2004 (Mutaqin 2018). However, it is also the case that 'most state interventions have further reinforced the hegemony of the conservative interpretation [of the Qur'an] in many Muslim societies' (Budiman 2008, p. 90), and this conservative interpretation is overwhelmingly patriarchal. Muslim feminists, addressing the patriarchy of mainstream and fundamentalist Islam, attempt a 'reinterpretation of the Qur'anic verses from the perspective of gender equality' (Nurmila 2011, p. 33), particularly on issues such as polygamy (van Wichelen 2009, p. 184), but in doing so are at pains to avoid being viewed as 'criticiz[ing] or chang[ing] the Qur'an' (Nurmila 2011, p. 33).

So, punk feminists' locus within a self-consciously 'underground' culture distinguishes them from other sections of the feminist movement – this counter-cultural grounding holds great potential in formulating critical perspectives on wider feminist initiatives in Indonesia, even whilst the transformative aspirations of feminist punks remain 'localized' within the scene.

Punk and feminism – a Potted HERstory

The general consensus amongst scholarship on women in punk (see, e.g., Leblanc 1999, Reddington 2007, O'Brien 1999, 2012, Nicholas 2007), with all the expected contestations, is that punk makes important steps towards challenging patriarchy, but that sexism persists in myriad forms within punk. Lauraine Leblanc's seminal book, *Pretty in Punk* (1999), considers that despite punk being 'the instrument of my liberation and self-empowerment ... the subculture put many of the same pressures on us as girls as did the mainstream culture we strove to oppose' (p. 6). Leblanc is damning of 'the male-dominated gender dynamics in the punk subculture, a subculture that portrays itself as being egalitarian, and even feminist, but is actually far from being either' (ibid.). Lucy O'Brien (1999, p. 194) concurs, writing that '[t]he punk scene ... was not always one of halcyon acceptance. While there were men wrestling with questions of masculinity and feminism, there were just as many content to leave it unreconstructed'. Helen Reddington's (2007, p. 194) analysis of early punk highlights the prominence of strong female role models in many bands, but refers to women being embroiled in a 'punk battle' in which 'attempts [were made] ... to prevent and discourage

women from being involved, but also ... to belittle and forget those who were part of it all, institutionalized misogyny is the last taboo'. Michelle Liptrot (2013, p. 222) highlights the 'contradiction between the sentiments of equality ... and in how male punks behave and react more generally to female punks, particularly females who are in a band'. So punk has a conflicted record – rhetorically feminist but often practically reproducing patriarchal norms.

Into the 1980s, anarcho-punk drew from anarchist political philosophy to sharpen the criticality of punk feminism, with examples of prominent and explicitly anarcho-feminist groups such as Poison Girls, DIRT, Toxic Waste, Rubella Ballet, and the Crass album *Penis Envy* (1981). However, even in anarcho-punk, feminism was not unequivocally championed. Rich Cross (2014) points to Crass's reaction to the essay by Poison Girls' Vi Subversa, 'The Offending Article', which was removed from a Crass Records release (Conflict 1983) because it suggested violent retribution, namely castration, against misogynistic men. Pacifism is clearly prioritized above feminism in Crass's hierarchy of values, and this is borne-out in wider research indicating that whilst anarcho-feminism was a prime concern for women in the anarcho-punk scene, men often treated such issues as peripheral or secondary (Donaghey 2016). In the 1990s, Riot Grrrl, even more than anarcho-punk, took feminism as a prime concern, and professed anarcho-feminist and intersectional tenets in its rhetorical output. However, whilst examples such as point 11 of the Riot Grrrl manifesto (Hanna 1991) list a range of oppressions: 'bullshit like racism, able-bodieism, ageism, speciesism, classism, thinism, sexism, anti-semitism and heterosexism', they did not specifically use the terminology of intersectionality (Crenshaw 1991) and it has been highlighted that Riot Grrrl's relationship with race, class and other interstices of oppression has been flawed (Nguyen 2012). Riot Grrrl, and specific Riot Grrrl interventions, continues to be an important point of reference for contemporary punk feminists, as discussed below, and Figure 1 (left) highlights an infogram slideshow produced by the Needle 'n' Bitch collective in Yogyakarta detailing the history and influence of the Riot Grrrl movement.

Whatever limitations surround these historical examples of punk feminism, the point to draw is that these interventions were necessary, and they remain so. As Sandra Jeppesen (2011, p. 44) points out, despite its commitment to 'anti-oppression politics', the punk scene draws participants from wider society where sexism is normal, and this 'internalized' norm is then replicated in punk scenes. This contested relationship between punk and feminism persists in the contemporary context of punk in Indonesia, and these contentions are magnified in the context of an acutely sexist society under the influence of religious fundamentalism, and given sharpened impetus against the backdrop of state-sponsored repression of punk.



Figure 1. Infogram slide shows posted to the Needle 'n' Bitch Instagram webpage. Left: 'Riot Grrrl dan geliat perempuan dalam scene hardcore/punk' (Riot Grrrl and women's struggle in the hardcore/punk scene). 3 March 2019. Right: 'Gerwani: Organisasi Perempuan Paling Maju dalam Sejarah Indonesia' (Gerwani: The Most Advanced Women's Organization in Indonesian History). 23 May 2019. Courtesy of the Needle 'n' Bitch Collective.

Punk, sexism and feminism in Indonesia

The punk scene in Indonesia is inevitably influenced by its context within a profoundly unequal society – as a crude indication of the relative position of women in Indonesia, the Gender Gap Report 2018 (World Economic Forum) ranked it 85th out of 149 countries, pointing especially to lower than average economic and political indices, and gender inequality is not improving – the first Gender Gap Report in 2006 (Haussman *et al.* 2006) ranked Indonesia 68th out of 115 countries.

Religion is also a significant factor, and levels of inequality for women in Indonesia are linked to the influence of Islamic fundamentalism. The dominance of morally conservative religion over state, society and culture is particularly acute in Aceh, where shari'a law is implemented, and in recent years overtly sexist prohibitions have been introduced on women being seen in public without hijab, a ban on unaccompanied women leaving their homes after sunset, and, in particular areas, a ban on female passengers straddling motorbikes forcing them to ride side-saddle, a curfew on women attending or working in venues such as internet cafés and sports halls after 11 pm, and a prohibition on women eating in public with men to whom they are not related. The sexist impacts of moral conservatism are also evident in non-shari'a areas – across Indonesia, the Human Rights Watch NGO highlighted the continuing practice of forcing female police and army recruits to undergo 'virginity tests' as recently as 2014 (Hodal 2014). A religious

influence is also evident in sexism in the punk scene in Indonesia, as will be discussed below.

The ideal of equality

Punk is associated with a set of transformative ethics, typically framed in anarchist terms, that includes equality as a core value, and this explicitly includes gender equality. As Nurul states in the documentary film, *Ini Scene Kami Juga!* (*This Is Our Scene Too!*, 2016), 'supposedly, HC [hardcore]/Punk's principle is to treat men and women with equality'. Dinda Advena concurs, saying that '[i]n a healthy punk scene, or an ideal one, you'll find empowerment', and Sheni frames it in the anarchist language of 'solidarity ... mutual respect because we're all humans, not women or men'.² Interviewee Dian, a member of the Bandung Pyrate Punx collective, was positive about gender equality in the punk scene in general:

[i]n the punk scene, I don't think it's very difficult ... Outside the scene, it's quite difficult being a woman punk. But inside the scene I feel no difficulties ... I am respected and I feel a sense of equality ... I feel comfortable and safe. (Interview with author, Sep 2012).

Interviewee Nadya, a (now former) member of the Bandung Pyrate Punx collective, concurred with this view, saying, 'we're quite egalitarian' (interview with author, Sep 2012). Such perceptions are echoed in *Ini Scene Kami Juga!*, by Rahma for whom, 'men and women are the same, everyone's appreciated for their contributions, their roles in the scene', and by Ika Vantiani commenting on gender differences in the scene, 'honestly, I don't think it should matter'. So gender equality is clearly an important value in the punk scene in Indonesia, as elsewhere, and is, at least to some degree, manifested in the scene. But, as Liptrot notes, it is worth questioning 'whether females not only tolerate sexism but also downplay it' (2013, p. 222), and indeed, the lived experience of punk in Indonesia often fails to meet this rhetorically expressed commitment to gender equality. As Mita put it in the film: 'People are saying equality, equality, everywhere they said equality, but the seniority was crazy, the hierarchy, the sexism was crazy', and in Mita's view the expressed value of gender equality is contradicted by 'the reality in the streets'. Susil, in an interview with author in Yogyakarta (Nov 2018), echoed this sentiment, saying that punks 'talk about anti-fascism, [anti-]racism ... anarchy, patriarchy ... But in their everyday life [they] still do [those things]'. Alda spoke at length about the mismatch between punk's stated values and (male) punks' actual behaviour:

In an ideal punk scene, actually whatever your gender, your sexuality ... it offers an oasis from society, right? Now it's like a trap, as it pretends to be that oasis, but in reality it is no different ... Problems arise in the punk scene when the

people in it started thinking they are different from the repressive society around them, just because they read a few slogans, and they wear patches with those slogans ... They do not realize that they are just as repressive and even more obnoxious because people come there thinking that they're coming to a place where repression does not exist, and they are fooled. The people are no different ... they act like we have eliminated hierarchy in the scene, which is a lie ... actually there's no gender equality, and there are still hierarch[ies] ... but people won't admit it. I find that delusion really annoying (in *Ini Scene Kami Juga!*, hereafter *ISKJ!*).

Clearly, the ideal of gender equality in the punk scene in Indonesia is not borne-out in lived experience, and sexist behaviours within the punk scene are viewed as being even 'more horrible' (Alda in *ISKJ!*) in their contradiction of punk's stated values – which is exactly as highlighted by Leblanc and Liptrot, above, and is a key motivation for feminist punk interventions.

Manifestations of sexism

Sexism is expressed in numerous ways in the punk scene in Indonesia, from gendered division of social spaces and labour roles, to sexual harassment and assault. Some of these manifestations will be detailed here, before moving on to highlight the feminist punk interventions that aim to disrupt sexist norms. The testimony from women subjected to marginalization, harassment, abuse, or sexual assault is harrowing – the act of re-presenting this testimony could be understood as a form of 'bearing witness' or, as discussed above, as a form of (neo-colonial and patriarchal) academic exploitation of trauma suffered by women. In an attempt to address this, the agency of the respondents has been emphasized as part of a dialogical research process, and many of the testimonies are drawn from the *Ini Scene Kami Juga!* documentary, which is in itself a feminist punk intervention created by punk women in Indonesia (discussed further below). Crucially, these experiences resonate with those of women in punk scenes everywhere in the world, and it is this ongoing sexism that makes feminist interventions so crucial to contemporary 'global' punk culture.

Homosociality and gender division

Several interviewees in the *Ini Scene Kami Juga!* documentary highlighted the extent of gender inequality in the punk scene: Ajeng Resista said 'the hc/punk scene ... is dominated by men'; Dinnah called it 'a man's scene' and Otex described it as 'a man's world'. Rusanti, in an interview in Yogyakarta in November 2018, stated that 'gender division is still very strong', whilst Nadya noted how homosociality was manifested at the famous Bandung punk hangout 'PI':

Sometime[s] the punk guy has a girlfriend, and the girlfriend is gonna be like their groupie. And [the women] like [are] sitting together ... not joining the

men [to] talk about 'the movement', the working stuff of the movement ... Mostly they just like become ... the groupies. (Interview with author, Sep 2012)

Puteri, in Banda Aceh, pointed to this phenomenon at gigs: 'there's no girls, almost no girls at all, only like the girlfriends of the band members' (interview with author, Oct 2018). In the film, Mita expressed her frustration at 'seeing how girls in this scene become nothing more than an accessory to their men. Like a thing. "Oh, I am so-and-so's girlfriend" like she has no identity of her own', and reflected on her own experience of this 'groupie' role: 'I felt like I was an accessory and I didn't like it. It was uncomfortable' (in *ISKJ!*). Rusanti described how this homosocial norm, combined with marginalization, exclusion and harassment, was an alienating experience for punk women:

At least from my experience during the late '90s, [early] 2000[s], there's quite some female punks in the *tongkrongan* [hangout] scene. They just hang out together and then they make bands and they sing or they also play, but ... it's always [for] a short term, either they got married ... or they got fed up with the very strong patriarchy and mach[ismo] and ... all the harassment and everything. (Interview with author, Nov 2018)

Dinnah put the lack of women down to 'how the outside world perceives us', '[w]e are used to the idea that the hc/punk scene is a man's scene. If a woman wants to enter the community, she has to know somebody in it. If you don't feel comfortable, then you won't come again' (in *ISKJ!*). Nadya discussed how this was echoed in the gendered division of labour roles:

[I]n this punk scene ... to be honest I see ... not [many] of the girls working like us together as a team, but ... many still women do the domestic work, and nobody really knows about the management. The management like the electricity, sound system, and I actually would really like to try to learn about that ... I always say like, I take care of all the guys, all the babies I have [laughs] ... But I don't really understand about the technic[al] thing[s] like, sound system. [There are] not many gir[s] who are active in here really, just like calm, watch[ing]. (Interview with author, Sep 2012)

So women are underrepresented in the scene, and those that do become involved are marginalized, and often become alienated and leave after a short time. The marginalized roles available to punk women are either the 'mothering' role described by Nadya, or the 'groupie' role described by Mita, Rusanti and Puteri. This is also reflected in the number of women in bands – gigs in Indonesia can typically feature more than a dozen bands, yet it is uncommon that *any* bands will include women, though there are important exceptions to this, discussed below.

Sexual objectification and harassment

Interviewee Budiwati discussed her experience of sexual objection: 'hang[ing] out with the punks, they talk about women's body ... yeah, I don't like that'.

Susil recalled being harassed by 'catcalling', as did Rusanti: 'women got really fed up with this whole daily sexism, macho attitude ... Giving comments about your skin colour or your ass or your boobs' (interviews with the author, Nov 2018). Alda also reflected on sexual objectification:

The first time I joined the community I felt like [the men saw] me as a chicky-chicky ... only seen as ... a sexual object, who is naïve, knows nothing, and you can use for sex ... I don't really mind the sexual objectification as long as the woman is mutually interested. But what's complicated is when she is sexually active, and then she's slut shamed, she's perceived as promiscuous. When she says no to other men, they turn on her. They say she's a snob, arrogant (in *ISKJ!*).

This marginalization and objectification of women in the punk scene is clearly rooted in a patriarchal and sexist mentality, and underpins sexual assault and responses to such attacks.

Sexual assault

CONTENT NOTE – participants recount experiences and effects of physical sexual assault including detail of assaults themselves.

This sexual objectification and harassment of women in the punk scene is also manifested in unwanted sexual touching and sexual assault – especially, as numerous women testify, in the moshpit. As Ina put it: 'I wondered why there aren't enough girls in the pit. And then I found out from experience ... Groping boobs. That's the simplest example' (in *ISKJ!*). Dinda Advena said: 'plenty of women are afraid and feel unsafe in the moshpit because they get groped' (ibid.). Nurul recounted a personal experience of sexual assault: 'we wanted to pogo, and then somebody groped my breasts and unfortunately I never found out who it was ... I was pissed off, I was really mad ... I haven't moshed again since that incident' (ibid.). Dinnah stressed the importance of 'fighting back' when subjected to sexual assault in the moshpit: 'when someone harasses³ me I have to fight back, show them that I am not okay with that. People need to know that they can't do that to me' (ibid.). But attempts to prevent, intervene, or fight back if attacked are not guaranteed to be met with support from others or to immediately affect the behaviour of the assailants. Rusanti detailed an unsuccessful attempt to call out a sexual assault:

one time in moshpit I got ... touched, and I f[ou]ght, and ... like this guy who touch[ed] me is like this senior, like really cool old guy from this really old punk band. And [then there's] this manhood solidarity thing and they even blame[d] me, 'it's your fault, why [are] you in the moshpit?'. (Interview with author, Sep 2012)

The violence of sexual assault is compounded by other men in the scene jumping to the defense of the assailant. As Rusanti says: 'Before when

somebody got harassed, it's normal [that] the woman got kicked out, got traumatized, and [is then] lost and gone' (interview with author, Nov 2018), and even when women have some support from men in the scene in opposing sexual assault, this does not illicit contrition from the assailant, as Sheni in Bandung recalled:

The one that made me cry was this gig at Saparua. As usual, everyone pogoed and moshed. There was one guy whom I didn't know, he came at me from behind and grabbed 'something', a part of my body. My friends found the guy. What's awful was he did not apologize to me. He apologized to my friends. It was like I was unimportant, like I was invisible (in *ISKJ!*).

The differing male responses to Rusanti's and Sheni's experiences represent distinct manifestations of patriarchy: in Sheni's case it is recognized that the man has acted wrongly, but the 'wrong' is in terms of interfering with another man's property – a woman (which is an extension of the 'groupie' scenario, above); whilst Rusanti is targeted with victim blaming that exonerates her attacker.

Victim blaming is especially prominent in online situations. For example, the singer of hardcore band SLOST, was sexually assaulted whilst stage diving at a gig – the incident was caught on film and posted to a social media website connected to the *Ini Scene Kami Juga!* documentary and blog. As *Vice* journalist Yudhistira Agato (2016) notes, '[s]ome commenters condemned the assailant. But the comment section quickly filled up with sexist and threatening posts'. Agato gives some examples: 'Neneng Bob' commented, 'Excuse me miss, but if you don't want to be harassed, then don't stage dive. That's the risk you take. Women[s] ... bodies are more sacred than men. Those men must've been aroused'; 'Dade Kusumo' said, 'You idiot. You're a woman and you crowd surfed? No wonder you got harassed'; and 'Syaiful Hidayah' epitomized the victim blaming succinctly, saying, 'It's not the man's fault. The girl provoked the man to perform such an act'. The social media page's moderator responded to one of the most offensive comments and subsequently received a personal message threatening her – it read: 'Tell me where you live and I'll come over to show you how good it feels [when your breasts are groped]' (Agato 2016).

This outright misogyny is but one manifestation of sexism along a continuum of abusive norms and behaviours in the punk scene in Indonesia. This is also expressed as 'anti-feminism'.

Anti-feminism

In an interview, Rusanti put it simply: 'there are punks [who] don't give a shit about feminism'. Despite the clear prevalence of blatant sexism, including harassment, abuse and assault, Pramilla Deva explained that, '[i]n the HC/Punk community, we are not doing enough to deal with this whenever a

problem arise[s]' (in *ISKJ!*). Budiwati concurred, saying 'the problem is ... big, but nobody speaks, right?' (interview with author, Nov 2018). Partly, this seems to come down to ignorance of the problem, or even a basic awareness of feminism as a concept, as Alda said 'some people call me sexist because I am sexually active' (in *ISKJ!*) and Ina said: 'Somebody said to me "if you are against sexism, why are you dating?" ... Turns out they thought that anti-sexism means anti-sex [celibacy]' (ibid). But there is a clear unease, even opposition, to highlighting the issue from within the punk scene. Rusanti identified this as a 'general problem in the punk scene, because women ... really have to break through by themselves, they're not encouraged by the environment' (interview with author, Nov 2018). Aulia, who grew up in the USA before migrating to Indonesia in 2010, also highlighted this anti-feminist attitude in the punk scene in Indonesia: 'it's actually more difficult being like a really active feminist [than being an anarchist] ... The women I know here ... they're really strong, [they] have a lot of problems here. And a lot of men and a lot of women hate them' (interview with author, Sep 2012). Rusanti said that being a woman meant that men in the punk scene were not likely to take her suggestions for activism seriously: '[T]hey feel threat[ened] because it came from a woman' (interview with author, Sep 2012).

The director of *Ini Scene Kami Juga!* discussed reactions from men in the punk scene to the film and clarified that her aim was to represent active female punks:

some say 'why are there only women [in the film]?' ... Then there are others [who say] 'Wow it can't be, it can't be like this, there must be an opinion from the men's side'. There may be some who object to the issue of abuse, [saying] that not all men are like that. Maybe so! But the majority of 'kids' in the hardcore punk scene still are. ... Actually, I don't want to answer their questions about why there aren't men. I have my own reasons. The film is titled 'This Is Our Scene Too', it is indeed focused on telling the experiences of women. (Interview with author, Oct 2018).

Anti-feminist attitudes are not limited to men in the punk scene. Interviewee Nadya said: 'I don't understand what they think about feminism, is [it] because they want to [be] men?' Nadya continued, arguing that gender division was natural or justified:

we live with values, like women have to be in the kitchen ... if you only can do that, should you try to do ... men's job? No! I mean actually we don't have to think that way about feminism. OK, you [referring to the male interviewer] can, like a guy ... go [to] work and have money and I will [be] doing household things ... [W]e're just using our talent ... [B]ecause if they think they want to be men, it's not feminism. (Interview with author, Sep 2012)

Nadya did not describe herself as being anti-feminist, but the comments she makes are based in on deeply patriarchal thinking, and echo the position

of Islamists who argue for the ‘naturally pre-determined [*kodrat*’] role for women as ‘housewives and mothers’ and the supremacy of men (Nurmilla 2011, p. 37). Hence, sexism is evidently internalized in the punk scene, not just in terms of sexist behaviour by men, but also in the acceptance of patriarchal norms as ‘natural’, including by *some* women. Interviewee Mawar reflected on this, saying, ‘[s]ometimes I feel like women have to conform or accept ... sexism ... in order to survive in the scene’ (interview with author, Nov 2018).

Religious aspects of sexism in punk

As highlighted above, fundamentalist Islam in Indonesia is a major influence in patriarchal oppression, and as Rusanti notes ‘religion issues also play [a] role here ... in the feminism and punk’. One manifestation she notes is men who:

consciously say ‘I don’t want to marry like punk girl, because they’re the same as me, like filthy’ and they think that if they went back to religion, their sins will be clear again. (Interview with author, Sep 2012).

They want to be back in the ‘right’ path. They found like a ... young girl, mostly with hijab. And then they started to build like ... normal family lifestyle. (Interview with author, Nov 2018).

There is also pressure on punk women from wider society and family. As Rusanti said:

Society, parents, everyone will judge them and say ‘Why are you still doing this? When are you going ... back to your *kodrat* ... Your fate as woman which is [to get] married, be a good wife, and serve your husband and kid(s), domestic[ity]’. (Interview with author, Nov 2018)

‘*Kodrat*’ can be translated as ‘God’s Will’. Whilst discussing feminist punk in the Russian context, Rourke and Wiget (2016 p. 236, emphasis added) highlight exactly this ‘secondary institutional violence of legislation and enculturation ... propped up/secured/obscured as ... *God’s immutable will*’. Whilst Rusanti points to aspects of this ‘enculturation’, Aceh province is a stark example of *legislated* patriarchy framed in specifically religious terms through shari’a law, and this inevitably affects the punk scene there. When asked why there were so few women in the Banda Aceh punk scene, interviewee Puteri replied that ‘the shari’a thing ... make[s] it harder for women to do that’ and, echoing Rusanti, said that ‘people’s judgement’ put women off participating.

Here in Aceh, you cannot live, you’re always being watched, y’know. So, when you are in a band, and especially a punk band, people will think badly of you. People will talk ... when you are in the scene, we know how it goes ... because



Figure 2. Lemuria, a power pop/punk band from the USA, performing at the Rodya Café in Banda Aceh, 16 February 2014. Courtesy of BNA Youth Booking.

we are in the punk [scene] ... people see us as a whore, y'know, cheap, very cheap girls. (Interview with author, Oct 2018)

Puteri continued that in the 'early 2010s, the shari'a is not really as strict as now. So during the concert [women] will dress as a punk vocalist, they don't have any veils, they wear very short sleeves, but still long pants', so the decline in women participating in the punk scene is in concert with widening shari'a legislation (Figure 2 shows several women in attendance at a gig in Banda Aceh in 2014). The decrease in the number of women was evident in the street punk community as well, with several women involved in 2012 and *none* in 2018. The remaining members of the Banda Aceh street punx (all men) said:

in Aceh it's hard for women to be punk. It doesn't mean we as punks don't welcome them to join together with us ... Actually, there were some women punks here before, but ... we have rules that [women] ... should be home from 10 pm onwards. The shari'a police are very conservative. When they see girls with boys together at night it is likely it will cause a negative impact. And we might get caught and their reason is because we might be doing some *khalwat*,⁴ which we don't. (Interview with author, Oct 2018)

The influence of religious fundamentalism is not limited to Aceh, however, and Dian, in Bandung, mocked the Islamic superstition that women singing in public is *haram* and can cause natural disasters: 'Wooo so powerful. Super

power. I can make disaster, I just sing out loud in public!’ (interview with author, Oct 2018).

Patriarchal oppression in wider Indonesian society is the core factor in the perpetuation of sexism in the punk scene, and this is recognized by women punks. Several respondents in the *Ini Scene Kami Juga!* documentary linked sexist behaviour by punks to patriarchal society: Ina said ‘[m]aybe it’s ignorance and habit ... they don’t really know why they do it, they are just conditioned to be that way ... they think it’s normal’; Alda said ‘[b]eing a woman you’re always in the wrong. Not just in the scene, but also in larger society’; Mita said ‘this is the result of generations of patriarchal values. We are embedded with patriarchal culture’; and Ika Vantiani said ‘[i]n the end we feel this is no different from how things are outside of the scene. The attitude, the politics, the prejudice, all of them’ (in *ISKJ!*). Interviewee Dian concurred saying: ‘From childhood, sexism has been introduced ... from ... religion, from family, from culture ... the mindset has been sexist ... And it can turn that person into a sexist ... it’s everywhere. In society. Even in the punk scene’ (interview with author, Oct 2018). The examples given above indicate the extent of patriarchal influence on the punk scene, but the goading contradiction is that this is happening in a scene that expresses gender equality as a core value.

Feminist interventions in punk in Indonesia

The extent of sexism in the punk scene in Indonesia has been made clear, and, as stated above, sexism is not unique to punk in Indonesia – sexism is a persisting problem in ‘global punk’, and a persisting problem in wider society everywhere in the world. But punk has also been a site of resistance to patriarchy, and punk’s core value of equality has animated numerous feminist initiatives. Deliberate and conscious feminist interventionism is a key aspect of punk in Indonesia, taking its cues from, according to Budiwati, ‘punk history itself’ and the core punk value of ‘equality for all ... no class ... no hierarchy ... Yes feminism should be important in the scene’ (interview with author, Nov 2018). Susil personally confirmed she was ‘looking for gaps to intervene’ (interview with author, Nov 2018) and the importance of actively intervening was also recognized by Dinnah, who said: ‘Women, if you want to be present in the hardcore/punk scene, you have to make the first move, you have to have your own initiative, not wait around to be asked’ (in *ISKJ!*). Ika Vantiani made the case for feminist intervention in the punk scene very strongly:

This scene is very masculine and dominated by men. So as a woman, I think we should step up. To tell them that this is what I want, this is where I want to be, and this is what I want to do. I want to feel safe in the moshpit, safe on stage, safe when I’m making my zines, safe at Food Not Bombs. I think the women

should come and do that ... you should not wait until it's handed to you, nor until you were asked. You have to step up and do it. Reclaim the space, you don't wait for them to hand it to you (in *ISKJ!*).

There are several feminist interventions in the punk scene in Indonesia: feminist zines, blogs and documentaries; women-centric bands; feminist gigs and festivals; and anarcha-feminist 'info-house' initiatives.

Zines, blogs and documentaries

Zines are an especially important point of communication and education in punk scenes (see Lohman 2017). Numerous respondents in the *Ini Scene Kami Juga!* documentary point specifically to zines as their first point of inspiration. Zines by women, or with a feminist focus, in Indonesia include: Bunpai Suru, Lust Slast Desire, Pussy Wagon, Lady Anarchy, Rebelicious, Puncak Muak, Cinderellatex, and numerous publications by the Needle 'n' Bitch and Metamorphoo collectives. Amongst others, Budiwati pointed particularly to zines by Ika Vantiani (founder of the Peniti Pink info-house) as a source of information and inspiration: 'From there I learn what feminism is, what punk itself is, what we have to do in our scene'. She further stressed this educative role:

our task is [to] give them education about sexism ... There are some punk kids who are ... what they call, intellectuals [laughs]. Like to read, active in hardcore punk scene activities, but yes, sexism also happens because they don't have that information and our job is to give that information to punk friends in the *kampungs*, on the streets. (Interview with author, Nov 2018)

The *Ini Scene Kami Juga!* film project started as a blog in 2008, documenting women involved in the hardcore punk scene. The director said:

actually the idea behind this documentary is simple, because I want to know why so few are involved ... in the scene ... Are they really not interested? Or are there other things? ... There were many questions that really had to be answered for me. And that's kind of 'doing the task'. It's like my job to make something for this scene. (Interview with author, Oct 2018)

The documentary has had a positive response from women in the punk scene, as the director reports, 'so many girlfriends told me that they thank me for making this ... because I became a representative of their feelings through this film' (interview with author, Oct 2018).

Bands

Women are very much in the minority in punk bands in Indonesia – as Puteri said 'girls in a band in general, any kind of genre is really rare' (interview with author, Oct 2018). But because the punk scene is so large, there are numerous examples,⁵ ranging over a plethora of punk sub-genres and styles, from Oi!

and ska to grind and hardcore, though examples of Riot Grrrl aesthetics and tropes are not common. Exceptions to this are the Grrrls Barricade collective in Semarang and the 'Girl to the Front!' campaign by Consumedia. As part of that campaign, Consumedia assert that the

moshpit does not only belong to men but also to women and anyone outside of binary gender identity. Sexism and various forms of sexual harassment that create discomfort in our community are no longer worth defending. We believe that by continuing to educate ourselves, practice communication and an open mind, we can create a safe and comfortable space in our community. (Consumedia Instagram webpage, 7 October 2019)

The postcard accompanying the 'Girl to the Front!' merchandize bundle – which includes a badge, t-shirt, and a CD album *Lullabies For A Broken World* by the band Dètention (2018) – states that 'hardcore punk should be a space for self-actualization, a catalyst and a catharsis that does not see boundaries including gender restrictions' (Consumedia Instagram webpage, 7 October 2019). The 'girls to the front' slogan was first popularized by the influential USA Riot Grrrl band Bikini Kill in the 1990s, though it is notable that the campaign's featured band, Dètention, is an all-male band.

However, emphasizing women in bands was not unequivocally celebrated – Dinda Advena notes that '[i]f there is a band with female members, we'd call it a female fronted band. Same with female illustrators, female photographers, female tattoo artists. I think it would be much cooler if you would look at their works first before labelling them with the word "female"' (in *ISKJ!*). Similarly, Nurul, who played with the band Dead Alley, said 'we didn't define ourselves as a female fronted band. Don't get me wrong, we just wanted people to get used to the fact that girls can play music' (in *ISKJ!*). Dian concurred:

I hate that term, women [being] the vocalist and ... the centre of attention like that. I don't like that term. So I tried to learn some instruments, and every time [people would say] 'come on ... we make [a] new band, and you're the vocalist'. No, I don't want to be [a] vocalist anymore. Maybe I want to try guitar or bass. (Interview with author, Oct 2018)

Despite the numerous examples of women in bands, this represents a tiny minority in a punk scene as large as Indonesia's, and as Dian highlights, women are overwhelmingly in the role of singer alongside male instrumentalists (see endnote 4). There is also a wariness about focusing on women in bands for fear of making them into a novelty, so describing these bands as 'women-centric' is highly qualified. This wariness also points to the negative reactions 'women-centric' bands may illicit – interviewee Nadya, continuing her theme of gender essentialism, mocked women in bands, saying, "'Oh, we want to be a feminist ... we want to be play music like boy[s] do'" ... even

though they[re] just like only the singer, they don't play [an] instrument' (interview with author, Sep 2012).

Gigs and festivals

Gigs and festivals are a central focus of punk scenes. Examples of women-centric gigs and festivals in Indonesia include 'Regirlution', 'Vive La Woman' and 'Lady Fast'. LadyFests, from which the Lady Fast events took their inspiration, developed in the wake of the Riot Grrrl movement, aiming 'to create a safe space for women to take ownership of, and participate in, music, creative activities, political debate and gender based activism' (O'Shea 2012, p. 5). In Indonesia, Mawar described Lady Fast as a collective effort 'to spread the ideas through music', including 'gigs but also with workshops and talks, and exhibitions' (interview with author, Nov 2018). The 2017 Lady Fast in Bandung was billed as 'an independent effort from us in building a safe and comfortable space for women to share, learn, work, network, and grow together' (Dead Alley Instagram Webpage 2017).

However, Dian suggested that Lady Fast was 'not in the punk scene, but [in] other communities' and that it was bands outside the punk scene that 'are indeed feminist bands that really carry feminist issues' (interview with author, Oct 2018). Several punk bands played at both incarnations of Lady Fast, so Dian's comment points towards a lack of support for the events from the wider (male dominated) punk scene, rather than a lack of punk involvement in the events themselves. The first Lady Fast was held in Yogyakarta in 2016, and the second in Bandung in 2017 (no Lady Fast has been held since). However, the Yogyakarta Lady Fast was disrupted by 'a group of men ... shouting "*Allahu Akbar*" ("God is great") and accusing organizers of "corrupting morals, dressing inappropriately [and] being communists"' (Chappelle 2016). The police stopped the mob's attack *and the festival*. The police 'did not arrest any of the hard-liners but instead they detained four Lady Fast organizers and participants, questioning them about the nature of their event and about a book on LGBT rights the police discovered at the venue' (Emont 2016). This incident highlights the repression faced by many feminist initiatives, punk or otherwise. The religious dimension is clear, as well as the continuing 'red scare' accusation of 'being communists'. The text accompanying the Gerwani infogram slide show in Figure 1 (right) harks back to the disruption of Lady Fast 1 in 2016:

A few years ago, at the dissolution of a women's event in Yogyakarta by a group of fundamentalist ... with words like 'Gerwani!' which is then followed by 'sluts!' and 'animals!' What comes to mind when you hear the word 'GERWANI'? Orgies and generals? Are you still scared and have to whisper when you hear or talk about it? (Needle 'n' Bitch Instagram webpage, 23 May 2019)

The ‘orgies and generals’ phrase relates to the accusation that Gerwani members were involved in the supposed *Partai Komunis Indonesia* (PKI, *the Communist party of Indonesia*) coup in 1965, sexually luring the army generals to be murdered. Anti-communism, and the attendant anti-feminism aimed at Gerwani, was a foundational myth of the Suharto regime. It is notable, however, that despite being a Marxist organization, the PKI was profoundly influenced by anarchism at key points (see Xiao and Donaghey [forthcoming](#)), and their newspaper, *Api*, featured quotes from Bakunin on its cover in the 1920s (Benda and McVey 1960).

This religious repression of feminism has also lately been combined with explicit state repression of anarchism, and anarcha-feminist info-houses such as Needle ‘n’ Bitch have been negatively affected, as discussed below.

Initiatives

Kolektif Betina (Women’s Collective – though ‘betina’ may also be translated as ‘slut’) began as a social media chat group. Currently, it is a communication and support network for punk women from at least nine cities across Indonesia and organized the Lady Fast events in Yogyakarta and Bandung. Although, the network connects local feminist initiatives such as Metamorphoo in Palembang and Needle ‘n’ Bitch in Yogyakarta, as well as other ‘non-punk’ feminist groups, Kolektif Betina do not actually describe themselves as feminists. Rather, they engage in ‘various actions to fight for the rights of all humans, regardless of gender’ (Hilmi 2017).

Metamorphoo, in Palembang, is ‘a women’s collective ... whose members come from various backgrounds such as artists, writers, ordinary workers, or housewives’ (Hilmi 2017), but is loosely associated with punk, as evidenced through their fundraising gigs for Lady Fast 2, and occasional quotes on



Figure 3. Women singing in punk bands. Left: Lips!!, from Jakarta, performing at Ruang Tamblong, Bandung, November 2019. Courtesy of John Fredericksen (Romarriot) @john.fredericksen. Right: Frustazy performing at Bandung Anarcho #4 fest, 5 August 2018. Courtesy of Frans Ari Prasetyo.

their social media feeds from punk bands such as G.L.O.S.S. (Girls Living Outside Society's Shit, a prominent queer-feminist/trans hardcore band from the USA). The 'Punk Against Rape' campaign was initiated by the Metamorphoo Collective in 2016 and included street demonstrations, discussion groups and the social media hashtag #punkagainstrape.

The longest running punk-associated feminist initiative in Indonesia is Needle 'n' Bitch in Yogyakarta, which started as InstitutA in Depok. Rusanti, from the collective, said

Needle 'n' Bitch could be considered kind of like the first anarcho feminist proclaimed group ... [We have] ma[d]e workshops, campaigns, and starting from there other groups or individuals are starting to ... have their own initiatives. So it's about spreading the spirit to other girls ... we try to promote and introduce values through activities together. (Interview with author, Nov 2018)

Needle 'n' Bitch 'provide free education and other resources dedicated to [the] community and people who can't access it', and they hold 'talks and discussions, workshops, campaign and education on women issue, gender equality, reproductive health and sexuality and politics' (Needle 'n' Bitch 2019, p. 6).

The introduction to this special issue points to 'changing levels of censorship and autonomy' in East and South East Asian contexts, particularly in terms of how 'underground(s)' change 'in their interdependence with growing threats' (Valjakka). This certainly has resonance for Needle 'n' Bitch – the collective was forced to vacate their last info-house in the wake of the 2018 Mayday riots in Yogyakarta during which a police station was burned down resulting in the trial of six anarchist activists (Actforfreedom 2018). Since then, Needle 'n' Bitch have been 'targeted by Yogyakarta local cops' with a concerted campaign against them in their local neighbourhood (Needle 'n' Bitch 2019, p. 11). Resonating with the Indonesian context, Rourke and Wiget (2016, p. 235) discuss Pussy Riot's 'Punk Prayer' protest in Russia, pointing to 'the subversive potential of even the most local, sporadic and symbolic feminist and queer challenges to established social order' and argue that the 'response of the Russian State exposed its dependence upon and investment in patriarchal and heteronormative power structures often rendered politically invisible through relegation to "private life"'. Indonesian society is highly unequal in terms of gender, and, as mentioned above in the World Economic Forum's Gender Gap Report, particularly unequal in 'political' and 'economic' indices – two areas in which the state is most equipped to intervene directly. Further, the influence of conservative religion, which promotes patriarchy as a virtue, has been highlighted. The repression of feminist initiatives by fundamentalist mobs *and* the police points to the perception of these initiatives as a threat to the state and its patriarchal interests.

Conclusion

This article has focused specifically on feminism within the punk scene in Indonesia – ‘global punk’ is a key factor in how this underground political culture recursively defines itself, but this is locally contingent. As discussed above, the punk perspective is distinctive amongst the wider feminist movement in Indonesia, and their interventions within the self-consciously ‘underground’ punk scene can be understood as activism at the level of ‘political culture’ (Lion 2014, p. 8) – indeed, this is a common factor amongst feminist punks elsewhere in the world, and highlights the anarchist underpinning of feminist punk initiatives and interventions.

The recent uptick in repression against feminist (and anarchist) initiatives in Indonesia has been discussed above – but because punk feminists take ‘undergroundness’ as a virtue, this repression is largely ineffective in disrupting the activism of these groups, and in fact feminism within the punk scene in many parts of Indonesia is flourishing (with the exception of Banda Aceh, as discussed above). Mawar said that the ‘women movement in [the] punk scene is ... growing ... it’s getting bigger right now’ and Budiwati concurred, saying, ‘I think yeh, it’s better right now ... [a] little bit. Because when [I] first ... joined [the] hardcore punk scene, sexism ... was really happening everywhere, every community. But now some communities ... learn to how “disappear” sexism’ (interviews with author, Nov 2018). This perceived improvement is partly in terms of an increased sense of safety, but also in terms of increased confidence amongst women to oppose unacceptable and abusive behaviour (Figure 4). As Rusanti said:

in a gig ... people start to announce ‘Please make this gig safe from sexual harassment’. And then if somebody get[s] caught they will get expelled or beaten up. And then women started to be brave to ... openly fight when they got harassed in the gig, they’ll say ‘you fuck!’ and then they baaam! (Interview with author, Nov 2018)

Dian said that, as a result of feminist interventions, the punk scene is moving ‘in a better direction. Now there are more people talking about feminism, anti-sexism ... [And] now outside the punk scene there are a lot of discourses about that too’ (interview with author, Oct 2018). Rahma, in the *Ini Scene Kami Juga!* documentary, also pointed to the importance of wider transformation, saying: ‘[b]eing a scenester is not an escape, it’s about how our idealism can bring an impact to change society’.

However, in terms of the transformation that feminist initiatives in the punk scene aim towards, Rusanti was clear that localized impacts are a priority, and that ‘what really matters is how ... we as women ... can fight in our own closest circle’ (interview with author, Nov 2018). Budiwati, in a similar vein, said



Figure 4. Punk Against Rape mural by Kelana Destin. Text below reads: ‘Ciptakan scena aman bagi perempuan #Riri Tidak Sendiri’ (‘Create a safe scene for women #Riri Is Not Alone’). Courtesy of the artist.

I don’t have expectations from outside of the scene. I don’t care [laughs] ... because if you want to think about the expectations of people outside the scene, it will be useless ... for now the more important thing is in the inner circle. (Interview with author, Nov 2018)

This focus on the ‘inner circle’ of punk women is clearly manifested in the importance given to ‘positive sisterhood’. Budiwati further elaborated that ‘empowering each other is really important to us, for women in punk’. Mawar defined ‘positive sisterhood’ as a ‘support system’ and knowing that ‘women are your friends not your enemy or your competitor’ (interview with author, Nov 2018). Echoing a Riot Grrrl motif, Dian described the Kolektif Betina chat group as a ‘girl gang’ (interview with author, Oct 2018). Nurul said ‘That’s what I like. Women in the punk scene sharing with each other’ (in *ISKJ!*), and Alda’s message for women watching *Ini Scene Kami Juga!* was to ‘[c]ollaborate instead of compete. It’s more fun that way’ (ibid.). This strongly resonates with the anarcha-feminism of Riot Grrrl, which emphasizes the importance of ‘the shaping of relationships’ as part of ‘an all-embracing approach’ which aims at ‘[c]reating spaces and modes of life as free as possible from hierarchies’ (Lion 2014, p. 6).

Whilst the focus of feminist punk activists and participants is on achievable local impacts in their 'inner circle', this necessarily has wider implications – as evidenced in the state's reaction to their initiatives as a threat to its patriarchal underpinning. As Rourke and Wiget (2016, p. 242) argue,

[w]hat is at stake today ... in many states throughout the world, is the role of religion in serving the state's need to manage the aspirations of embodied persons ... a situation made even more problematic when the legitimacy of the state is questioned.

The anarchist underpinning of punk feminism brings that questioning of state legitimacy to the fore explicitly. The transformative influence of feminist punk remains 'localized' within the scene, and intentionally so, but this counter-cultural perspective has the potential for constructive critique of 'mainstream' feminist groups in Indonesia which aim to influence the state or religious institutions, and these punk initiatives represent a significant and distinctive political/cultural platform for feminism in wider Indonesian society.

Notes

1. For example, Superman Is Dead from Bali signed to Sony in 2003, Rocket Rockers from Bandung released one album with Sony in 2004, and Pee Wee Gaskins from Jakarta signed to Universal in 2016 – these bands can all be described musically as 'pop-punk'.
2. All quotes from the *Ini Scene Kami Juga!* documentary use the translated English subtitles from the film.
3. Sexual assault is frequently termed as 'harassment' by women in Indonesia.
4. *Khalwat* refers to an unmarried man and woman being along together, which, according to Islamic jurisprudence, must be avoided as it is considered *haram* (indecent or prohibited).
5. Two of the very few examples of all-women punk bands in Indonesia include D'Ponis from Bandung and Angel of Danger from East Java (Inner Struggle from Jakarta have three women and one man, Dead Alley from Semarang have three women with two men). Numerous other bands feature at least one woman, sometimes on guitar or bass (or more rarely on drums or saxophone), such as Almost Brother, Dental Surf Combat, Goads, Hakuna Matata, Leftyfish, Pretty Riot, Take One Step, The Frankenstone, The Skincrawler, Wicked Flesh, but most commonly as vocalists (Figure 3), including All Out 99, Atret, Backball, Cherrybull, Confess, Delta Force, Democrazy, DieXFast, Dispenser, Dynamite, Fat In Diet, Final Step, Fire Bender, Floco, Frustazy, Kontaminasi Kapitalis, Kroia, Lilith, Lips!!, Maximum Thrash, Moonshine, Negasi, No Remain, Nothing, Oath, Porno Star, Proyek Liar, Ravage, Rebellion Rose, Rotten Colony, Same Old Story, Silly Riot, SLOST, SlowXFast, Step Forward, Step Sister, Sugarkane, The Loads, The Nag-NagNag, The View, Through Out, Total Confused, Trust.

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author(s).

Notes on contributor

Jim Donaghey is a punk working in academia as a member of the Centre for Media Research at Ulster University, Coleraine. Jim has maintained a close relationship with punk and anarchist communities in Indonesia over the last nine years, helping with various solidarity campaigns for activist groups and co-releasing international 'split' records with bands including Krass Kepala (Bandung) and Ravage (Batu), in addition to several periods of ethnographic research there. Jim currently plays with the d-beat band Lawfucker, and was recently awarded an Early Career Fellowship Grant by the Arts and Humanities Research Council (UK) to undertake a three-year research project titled: 'Failed States and Creative Resistances: The Everyday Life of Punks in Belfast, Banda Aceh, Mitrovica and Soweto'.

ORCID

Jim Donaghey  <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-3024-5565>

References

- Actforfreedom. 2018. Indonesia: Update on the Anarchist Prisoners from Yogyakarta. Act for Freedom Now! [online]. 20 August. Available from: <https://actforfree.nostate.net/?p=31300> [Accessed 5 June 2019].
- Adriany, V., Pirmasari, D.A., and Satiti, N.L.U., 2017. Being an Indonesian feminist in the North. *Tijdschrift voor genderstudies*, 20 (3), 287–297.
- Agato, Y., 2016. Indonesia's Punk Scene Has a Sexual Assault Problem [online]. Vice, 14 December. Available from: https://www.vice.com/en_asia/article/78bdvd/indonesian-punk-scene-struggles-with-sexual-assault-harassment [Accessed 5 June 2019].
- Benda, H.J., and McVey, R.T., 1960. *The Communist Uprisings of 1926-27 in Indonesia, Key Documents*. Ithica: Cornell University Press.
- Budiman, M., 2008. Treading the path of the shari'a: Indonesian feminism at the crossroads of western modernity and Islamism. *Journal of Indonesia social sciences and humanities*, 1, 73–93.
- Chappelle, J. 2016. Islamic Fundamentalists Disrupt Indonesian Feminist Punk Gig [online]. IQ (4 April). Available from: <https://www.iq-mag.net/2016/04/islamists-disrupt-indonesia-punk-gig-kolektif-betina-yogyakarta/> [Accessed 17 March 2019].
- Conflict, 1983. *To A Nation of Animal Lovers*. EP. Corpus Christi: Epping Forest.
- Consumedia Instagram webpage. 2020. <https://www.instagram.com/consumedia/> [accessed 1 August 2020]
- Crass, 1981. *Penis Envy. album*. Epping Forest: Crass Records.
- Crenshaw, K., 1991. Mapping the margins: intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color. *Stanford Law Review*, 43 (6), 1241–1299.
- Cross, R., 2014. 'Take the toys from the boys': gender, Generation and anarchist Intent in the work of Poison girls. *Punk & Post-punk*, 3 (2), 117–145.
- Dead Alley Instagram webpage. 2020. <https://www.instagram.com/p/BTERmgsh1M1/> [accessed 29 July 2020].
- Dead Alley, 2016. *Minima Moralia. album*. Bekasi: Greg Mike and Kim Records.
- Détention, 2018. *Lullabies For A Broken world. album*. Palembang: Rimauman Music/Depok: Necros Records/Kediri: Resting Hell.

- Donaghey, J., 2016. *Punk and anarchism: UK, Poland, Indonesia*. Thesis (PhD). Loughborough University.
- Donaghey, J., 2017. Researching 'punk Indonesia': notes towards a non-exploitative insider methodology. *Punk & post-punk*, 6 (2), 291–314.
- Driscoll, C., and Morris, M., 2013. Introduction: gender, modernity and media in the Asia-Pacific. *Cultural studies*, 27 (2), 165–185.
- Emont, J., 2016. Islamist Intolerance Poses a growing threat to Indonesia's Minorities [online]. *TIME*, 20, April. Available from: <http://time.com/4298767/indonesia-intolerance-muslim-islamist-minorities-lgbt-christians-hardliners/> [Accessed 5 June 2019].
- Hanna, K., 1991. Riot Grrrl manifesto. *Bikini Kill*, 2, Available from: <https://rebelgrrrl.wordpress.com/2010/02/24/the-riot-grrrl-manifesto/> [Accessed 5 October 2019].
- Hausmann, R., Tyson, L.D., and Zahidi, S., 2006. *The Global Gender Gap Report 2006*. Geneva: World Economic Forum. Available from: http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_GenderGap_Report_2006.pdf [Accessed 5 June 2019].
- Hilmi, M., 2017. Kolektif Betina [online]. *Whiteboard journal*, 8, May. Available from: <https://www.whiteboardjournal.com/focus/ideas/kolektif-betina/> [Accessed 5 June 2019].
- Hodal, K., 2014. Female Indonesian police recruits forced to undergo 'virginity tests' [online]. *The guardian*, 18, November. Available at: <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/nov/18/female-indonesian-police-recruits-forced-virginity-test> [Accessed 27 November 2015].
- Holtzman, B., Hughes, C., and van Meter, K., 2007. Do it Yourself ... and the movement beyond Capitalism. In: E. Biddle, S. Shukaitis, and D. Graeber, ed. *Constituent Imagination: Militant Investigations//collective Theorization*. Edinburgh: AK Press, 44–61.
- Ini Scene Kami Juga! [This Is Our Scene Too], 2016. *Film*. Directed by Hera Mary. Bandung: Hungry Heart Project.
- Jeppesen, S., 2011. The DIY post-punk post-situationist politics of CrimethInc. *Anarchist studies*, 19 (1), 23–55.
- Karam, A.M., 1998. *Women, Islamism and the state: contemporary Feminisms in Egypt*. New York: St Martin's Press.
- Leblanc, L., 1999. *Pretty in punk. girls' gender resistance in a boys' subculture*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.
- Lion, V., 2014. When anarcha-queer-feminism meets grrrl culture – Riot Grrrl as an example for anarcha-queer-feminist practices [online]. https://www.academia.edu/28999477/When_anarcha-queer-feminism_meets_grrrl_culture_Riot_Grrrl_as_an_example_for_anarcha-queer-feminist_practices [Accessed 24 June 2019].
- Liptrot, M., 2013. 'Different people with different values but the same overall goals': Divisions and unities within the contemporary British DIY punk subcultural movement. *Punk & post-punk*, 2 (3), 213–229.
- Lohman, K., 2017. *The connected lives of Dutch punks*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Mackintosh, J.D., Berry, C., and Liscutin, N., 2010. *Cultural studies and cultural industries in Northeast Asia: what a difference a region makes*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press. 1–22.
- Mutaqin, Z.Z., 2018. Culture, Islamic feminism, and the quest for legal reform in Indonesia. *Asian journal of women's studies*, 24 (4), 423–445.
- Needle 'n' Bitch Collective, 2019. *Solidarity Call: Rebuilding Community and Women Safe Space*. June.
- Needle 'n' Bitch Instagram webpage, 2020. <https://www.instagram.com/needleandbitch/> [accessed 4 August 2020].

- Nguyen, M.T., 2012. Riot grrrl, race, and revival. *Women & performance: A journal of feminist theory*, 22 (2-3), 173–196.
- Nicholas, L., 2007. Approaches to gender, power and authority in contemporary anarcho-punk: poststructuralist anarchism? [online]. *Esharp*, 9, spring. Available from: http://www.gla.ac.uk/media/media_41219_en.pdf [Accessed 22 May 2012].
- Nurmila, N., 2011. The influence of global Muslim feminism on Indonesian Muslim feminist discourse. *Al-Jami'ah: journal of Islamic studies*, 49 (1), 33–64.
- O'Brien, L., 1999. The woman punk made me. In: R. Sabin, ed. *Punk rock: so what? The cultural legacy of punk*. London: Routledge, 186–198.
- O'Brien, L., 2012. Can I have a taste of your ice cream? *Punk & post-punk*, 1 (1), 27–40.
- O'Shea, S., 2012. Feminist Music Worlds – Riot Grrrl, Ladyfest and Rock Camp for Girls. New Left Project, (4 January), 1–8.
- Reddington, H., 2007. *The lost women of rock music: female musicians of the punk era*. Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing.
- Rourke, B., and Wiget, A., 2016. Pussy riot, putin and the politics of embodiment. *Cultural studies*, 30 (2), 234–260.
- Shome, R., 2009. Post-colonial reflections on the 'internationalization' of cultural studies. *Cultural studies*, 23 (5-6), 694–719.
- Spivak, G.C., 2000. Translation as culture. *Parallax*, 6 (1), 13–24.
- United Nations General Assembly, 1979. Convention on the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women. *UN Treaty Series*, 1249 (14), New York: United Nations. Available from: https://treaties.un.org/doc/Treaties/1981/09/19810903%2005-18%20AM/Ch_IV_8p.pdf [Accessed 4 October 2019].
- van Doorn-Harder, N., 2016. *Indonesian Muslim feminists. Islamic Reasoning, Rumah Kitab and the case of child Brides* [online]. Boston University, Institute on Culture, Religion & World Affairs. Available from: https://research.vu.nl/ws/portalfiles/portal/47831718/Rumah_Kitab_child_brides.pdf [Accessed 3 October 2019].
- van Wichelen, S., 2009. Polygamy talk and the politics of feminism: contestations over masculinity in a new Muslim Indonesia. *Journal of international women's studies*, 11 (1), 173–188.
- World Economic Forum, 2018. *The Global Gender Gap Report 2018*. Geneva: World Economic Forum. Available from: http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_GGGR_2018.pdf [Accessed 5 June 2019].
- Xiao, J., and Donaghey, J., forthcoming. *Punk in China and Indonesia: cultural activism in repressive contexts*.